



## Early Journal Content on JSTOR, Free to Anyone in the World

This article is one of nearly 500,000 scholarly works digitized and made freely available to everyone in the world by JSTOR.

Known as the Early Journal Content, this set of works include research articles, news, letters, and other writings published in more than 200 of the oldest leading academic journals. The works date from the mid-seventeenth to the early twentieth centuries.

We encourage people to read and share the Early Journal Content openly and to tell others that this resource exists. People may post this content online or redistribute in any way for non-commercial purposes.

Read more about Early Journal Content at <http://about.jstor.org/participate-jstor/individuals/early-journal-content>.

JSTOR is a digital library of academic journals, books, and primary source objects. JSTOR helps people discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content through a powerful research and teaching platform, and preserves this content for future generations. JSTOR is part of ITHAKA, a not-for-profit organization that also includes Ithaka S+R and Portico. For more information about JSTOR, please contact [support@jstor.org](mailto:support@jstor.org).

many verses long under suspicion are indeed spurious, but he has rescued many others from unjust doubts. Everything works out with astounding precision, so that by the rejection of the small number of 2,193 verses and by some shifting and rearranging of the balance there emerge just the 45 songs, each of 300 verses. Indeed so ably is the material handled that one can hardly doubt that Mr. Smyth can take the same poetry and find that it would exactly fit into 30 songs, each of 500 verses.

When Fick made his great discovery of the secret law of numbers he found that the *Iliad* was made up of lays of 242 verses each, but later when he stumbled on the great truth that Homer wrote only in multiples of 3 and that the fifth power of 3 was 243, then oddly enough he saw that just one genuine line too much had been rejected from each song, and this one line gave the needed 243.

Mr. Smyth thinks future editors should publish only these 13,500 verses, since they alone are genuine, while the rest destroy the appreciation of Homer.

It might be interesting to see how his tests of rejected verses agree with those of Van Leeuwen; I mean the tests in regard to the duration of the Trojan War. Smyth regards as genuine B, 295; M, 15; and  $\Omega$  765, verses which definitely assign ten years to the Trojan War. Indeed he does not even question their Homeric authorship, while he as certainly banishes from the *Iliad* many of those verses on which Van Leeuwen rested his theory of the short war. This shows how hard it is for any two interpolation theories to agree; Smyth sets up one rule and then cuts the *Iliad* down to that; Van Leeuwen, an entirely different rule, and proceeds to adjust Homer to that, and both end with a different and inferior Homer. If Homer had been forced to pick up and carry every poor verse found in his way, then unlucky Onomacritus deserves the tears of the world, for he was banished from Athens for adding a harmless verse to so trifling a poet as Musaeus. Does anyone believe that a conservative spirit which would not tolerate the addition of a single verse to the poetry of Musaeus would have stood quietly by while 2,193 verses were added to the *Iliad*?

Mr. Smyth knows Homer and has literary appreciation and high ability, but any theory which rests on numerical identities or free interpolations in Homer is doomed in advance to failure.

JOHN A. SCOTT

NORTHWESTERN UNIVERSITY

---

*Recent Developments in Textual Criticism.* An Inaugural Lecture  
Delivered before the University [of Oxford] on June 6, 1914.  
By ALBERT C. CLARK. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1914.  
Pp. 28. 1s.

The pamphlet opens with a tribute to the late Robinson Ellis and to his success in promoting classical research in England. The paper proper deals first with the importance of paleography in modern textual criticism, and a

summary of the advance along this line is given: the aid of photographs, the work of Traube, the study of local hands. Clark then turns to the assistance rendered by historical study, citing as an example the important results gained for the study of Cicero from a mediaeval MS catalogue. Here as elsewhere in the pamphlet he alludes briefly to his truly wonderful work on the text of Cicero—a work which will long stand as a monument. Other matters taken up briefly are the effect of the Caroline Renaissance and the great Renaissance, the mistakes and characteristics of scribes, the critical principles furnished by newly found papyri, namely that we must not despise late MSS and especially that we must not reject passages omitted in the older and supposedly better MSS. Some attention is then devoted to prose rhythm and its usefulness in text criticism, both in deciding between variant readings and in testing suspected works. More space is devoted to the omission of lines in MSS, and a brief résumé is given of a recent book by the author on the *Primitive Text of the Gospels and Acts*. His method of utilizing omissions to draw conclusions about the archetype is not new (cf., e.g., Rand in *AJP*, XXVI, 329, note), but its application to New Testament criticism is new. His conclusions will be of great importance if accepted by New Testament critics, for he asserts the genuineness of a number of passages usually rejected as interpolations. He seems, however, to carry his method too far. A study of a similar sort is promised soon for Cicero.

The paper, in short, is an authoritative, lucid, and stimulating review of recent progress in textual criticism (for a paper covering in part the same ground, cf. the reviewer's "Present Status of Latin Text Criticism" in the *Classical Weekly*, IV, 25 ff.).

B. L. ULLMAN

UNIVERSITY OF PITTSBURGH

---

## Recent Books

---

Foreign books in this list may be obtained of Lemcke & Buechner, 30-32 West 27th St., New York City; G. E. Stechert & Co., 151-55 West 25th St. New York City.

- BENN, A. W. *The Greek Philosophers*. 2d ed., corrected and partly rewritten. New York: E. P. Dutton. 8vo, pp. 619. \$6.00 net.
- CHEESMAN, G. L. *The Auxilia of the Roman Imperial Army*. New York: Oxford University Press. 8vo, pp. 192. \$1.75 net.
- COOK, A. B. *Zeus, a Study in Ancient Religion*. Cambridge: The University Press, 8vo, pp. xliii+885.
- DEAN, L. R. *Index to Facsimiles in the Paleographical Society Publications*. Princeton: The University Library. 8vo, pp. 55. \$1.00 net.
- LUCRETIVUS. *The Nature of Things*. (Bohn Popular Library.) New York: Macmillan. 16mo, pp. 20+267. \$0.35 net.
- NORTON, R. *Bernini and Other Studies in the History of Art*. New York: Macmillan. 4to, pp. 217.
- PLUTARCH. *Lives*. Vol. II. (Bohn Popular Library.) New York: Macmillan, 16mo, pp. 32+463. \$0.35 net.